Challenges and Opportunities in the Labor Market and the Role of Data-Driven Policy

Betsey Stevenson
Member, Council of Economic Advisers

June 23, 2015

Average Monthly Job Growth by Year, 2007–2015

- Data for 2015 are for January-May only.

*Data for 2015 are for January-May only.
Overview

- **Five Longer-Term Challenges**
  - Declining labor force participation
  - Elevated rates of part-time work for economic reasons
  - Heightened long-term unemployment
  - Lower labor market fluidity
  - Stagnating wages

- **Relationships Between Labor Market Challenges and the Role of Longitudinal Data**
Overview

• **Five Longer-Term Challenges**
  • Declining labor force participation
  • Elevated rates of part-time work for economic reasons
  • Heightened long-term unemployment
  • Lower labor market fluidity
  • Stagnating wages

• **Relationships Between Labor Market Challenges and the Role of Longitudinal Data**
Labor Force Participation Has Fallen Among Men and Women Since 2000

Of the Participation Decline Since 2007, More than Half is Due to an Aging Population and One-Sixth is Due to the Business Cycle

Note: Year axis denotes first quarter of year noted. See Chapter 3 of the 2015 Economic Report of the President for methodological details.

There is Less Disagreement in the Literature on the Participation Rate than May be Apparent at First Glance

Comparison of Participation Rate Estimates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Time Period</th>
<th>Shares of the Total Decline</th>
<th>CEA Estimated Shares Over Same Time Period</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Trend</td>
<td>Cycle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beginning in 2007</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBO (2014)</td>
<td>2007:Q4 – 2013:Q4</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Aaronson et al. (2014)</td>
<td>2007:Q4 – 2014:Q2</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Aaronson et al. (2014)</td>
<td>2007: Q4 – 2014:Q3</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erceg and Levin (2013)</td>
<td>2007-2012</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fallick and Pingle (2013)</td>
<td>2007:Q4 – 2013:Q2</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kudlyak (2013)</td>
<td>2007-2012</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shierholz (2012)</td>
<td>2007-2011</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Zandweghe (2012)</td>
<td>2007-2011</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aaronson et al. (2006)</td>
<td>2007-2013</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other time periods</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fujita (2014)</td>
<td>2000:Q1 – 2013:Q4</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aaronson, Davis, and Hu (2012)</td>
<td>2000-2011</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Cited studies; CEA calculations.
• **Five Longer-Term Challenges**
  • Declining labor force participation
  • Elevated rates of part-time work for economic reasons
  • Heightened long-term unemployment
  • Lower labor market fluidity
  • Stagnating wages

• **Relationships Between Labor Market Challenges and the Role of Longitudinal Data**
Part-Time Work Increases During Recessions Due to Increased Rates of Part-Time Work for Economic Reasons

Note: Shading denotes recession. Dashed lines represent pre-Great Recession (December 2001-December 2007) averages. See Chapter 3 of the 2015 Economic Report of the President for details on comparability over time.

Part-Time Work for Economic Reasons is Falling at a Rate Similar to What the 1980s and 2001 Recessions Would Predict

Note: The 1980s recessions are consolidated into a single cycle.
Overview

• **Five Longer-Term Challenges**
  • Declining labor force participation
  • Elevated rates of part-time work for economic reasons
  • Heightened long-term unemployment
  • Lower labor market fluidity
  • Stagnating wages

• **Relationships Between Labor Market Challenges and the Role of Longitudinal Data**
Long-Term Unemployment Has Accounted for Almost 3/4 of the Decline in the Unemployment Rate Over the Past 12 Months

Unemployment Rate by Duration

Percent of Labor Force

Note: Shading denotes recession. Dashed lines represent pre-Great Recession (December 2001-December 2007) averages.
Long-Term Unemployment Has Accounted For an Increasingly Large Share of the Increase in Total Unemployment Over the Past Half Century

Note: Time trend projection is based on data from 1948 through 2007.
Multiple Measures Show Labor Market Fluidity Has Increased Since the Great Recession...

Hires, Separations, and Job-to-Job Flow Rates, 2000–2013

Percent of Employment

Note: J2J job-to-job hires are generally equal to J2J job-to-job separations (not shown). Shading denotes recession.
...But Fluidity Has Been Declining for Decades

Trends in Hires and Separations, 1995-2012

Workers are Less Likely to Change Employers, Occupations, and Industries

Source: Molloy, Smith, and Wozniak (2014)
Firm and Establishment Entry Rates Have Also Declined

Firm and Establishment Entry Rates, 1978–2012

Percent of Total Firms/Establishments

Source: Census Bureau, Business Dynamics Statistics; CEA calculations.
Overview

• **Five Longer-Term Challenges**
  • Declining labor force participation
  • Elevated rates of part-time work for economic reasons
  • Heightened long-term unemployment
  • Lower labor market fluidity
  • Stagnating wages

• **Relationships Between Labor Market Challenges and the Role of Longitudinal Data**
The Productivity-Wage Gap Appears Large

Cumulative Growth in Productivity and Wages, 1979-2014

Index (1979=1)

Productivity - Measured by BLS

Median Hourly Wages

The Productivity-Wage Gap Has Multiple Components, the Largest of Which is a Difference in Deflators

Cumulative Growth in Productivity and Wages, 1979-2014

Index (1979=1)

Inequality Has Increased as Wages Have Stagnated for Most Workers, But Risen For the Highest-Earners

Note: The figure depicts real hourly wage quantiles for workers age 18 to 64, excluding individuals who are self-employed, who have real wages below $0.50 or greater than $100 (in 1989 dollars), or whose wages are imputed. Top-coded earnings adjusted following Lemieux (2006). Inflation adjusted using the CPI-U-RS. Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, Current Population Survey (Merged Outgoing Rotation Groups); CEA calculations.
Overview

• Five Longer-Term Challenges
  • Declining labor force participation
  • Elevated rates of part-time work for economic reasons
  • Heightened long-term unemployment
  • Lower labor market fluidity
  • Stagnating wages

• Relationships Between Labor Market Challenges and the Role of Longitudinal Data
Four New Working Papers Suggest Firm-Side Behavior May be Linked to Fluidity, Wage Growth, and Inequality

Moscarini and Postel-Vinay (2015)
- Use data from JOLTS
- Suggestive evidence of “job ladder” from smaller to larger firms that collapsed during the Great Recession

Haltiwanger, Hyatt, and McEntarfer (2015)
- Use matched employer-employee LEHD data
- No evidence of “job ladder” from smaller to larger firms, but evidence of worker reallocation from lower-paying to higher-paying firms

Kahn and McEntarfer (2014)
- Use matched employer-employee LEHD data
- Separations – especially those most likely to be voluntary – tend to drop more sharply among lower-paying firms during recessions

Song et al. (2015)
- Use data sampled from the Social Security Administration Master Earnings File
- Nearly all of the rise in earnings inequality between 1982 and 2012 was due to increases in between-firm earnings inequality
Challenges and Opportunities in the Labor Market and the Role of Data-Driven Policy

Betsey Stevenson
Member, Council of Economic Advisers

June 23, 2015